



**MINUTES
CHESAPEAKE BAY PRESERVATION AREA BOARD
VIRGINIA BEACH, VIRGINIA
FEBRUARY 27, 2017**

Chair Mr. Jester, called to order the **Chesapeake Bay Preservation Area Board** meeting in the City Council Chambers, City Hall Building, Virginia Beach Municipal Center, on Monday, February 27, 2017.

A motion was made by Mr. Poole and seconded by Mr. Sobota to approve the January 23, 2017 minutes. All voted for the motion except Mr. Jester who was abstained and Mr. Jones who was abstained due to his absence from the January meeting. This vote also serves as the official roll call for this meeting. All members were present.

BOARD ACTION: APPROVED JANUARY 23, 2017 MINUTES ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

AYE 7 NO 0 ABSTAIN 2 ABSENT 0

FRANCE	AYE
JESTER	ABSTAIN
JONES	ABSTAIN
MARTIN	AYE
MCCOY	AYE
MCDANIELS	AYE
POOLE	AYE
SMITH	AYE
SOBOTA	AYE

Board Members Present: David France, David Jester, Arthur Jones, Brad Martin, Wayne McCoy, June McDaniels, Richard Poole, Reese Smith, and Dennis Sobota.



Applicant **Matthew and Kathy Ligon**
Address **2609 Moss Road**
Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
City Council District **Lynnhaven**

Agenda
Item

1

Description: GPIN: 1499-67-8831

AGENT: Billy Garrington, Governmental Permitting Consultants

BOARD ACTION: APPROVED WITH 17 CONDITIONS ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

CPBA Variance Conditions:

1. A pre-construction meeting shall be held with the CBPA Inspector prior to any land disturbance, including demolition.
2. Land disturbance shall be limited to the area necessary to provide for the proposed use or development. Said areas of land disturbance shall be quantified on revised site plan submittals.
3. The construction access way, staging area, stockpiling area and contractor parking area shall be noted on the site plan. **Said areas shall be quantified as land disturbance if not occurring on a paved or graveled surface.**
4. Wire reinforced 36-inch silt fence, for erosion and sedimentation control measures, shall be installed prior to any land disturbance and shall remain in place until such time as vegetative cover is established. Said silt fence shall be installed as delineated per the CBPA Variance Exhibit.
5. Construction limits shall be contained within the limits of the delineated silt fence per the CBPA Variance Exhibit for upland improvements.
6. For all trees to be preserved outboard of the limits of construction that are encroached upon, replacement of existing vegetation shall be provided at a 3 to 1 ratio for all unauthorized (damaged or removed) vegetation impacts.
7. Permanent and / or temporary soil stabilization measures shall be applied to all disturbed / denuded area(s) prior to a final building inspection or certificate of occupancy. All disturbed or denuded areas shall be stabilized in accordance with the Virginia Erosion and Sediment Control Law and Regulations.

8. A site plan shall be submitted to the Department of Planning and Community Development, Development Services Center (DSC) for review and approval prior to the issuance of a building permit.
9. Submitted concurrent with the site plan shall be a separate planting / buffer restoration plan detailing location, number, and species of vegetation to be installed as per the buffer restoration requirements. The planting / buffer restoration plan shall clearly delineate existing naturalized area (forest floor), planting beds, turf zones and areas of shoreline vegetation to be managed permitting sunlight to interface with tidal fringe marsh.
10. Stormwater management shall comply with the requirements set forth within the Code of Ordinances, Appendix D – Stormwater Management.
11. Buffer restoration shall be installed equal to 200 percent of the proposed new impervious cover within the RPA: **1,880 square feet x 200 percent = 3,760 square feet.**

Said restoration shall achieve the full complement of vegetation consisting of canopy trees, understory trees, shrubs and groundcovers consistent with the Riparian Buffers Modification & Mitigation Guidance Manual, prepared by Virginia Dept. of Conservation & Recreation, Chesapeake Bay Local Assistance: **10 canopy trees, 10 understory, 20 large shrubs, and 30 small shrubs.**

The required restoration shall be located in the Resource Protection Area, in areas currently devoted to turf or where impervious cover is removed. The restoration shall have a mulch layer of material 4 inches to 6 inches in depth. Said restoration areas shall be maintained and not removed or allowed to revert to turf in the future. The required trees shall be comprised of approximately 50 percent deciduous and 50 percent evergreen species and shall be evenly distributed within the RPA buffer. Trees shall not be planted within 15 feet of the shoreline where such planting would result in marsh shading or interference with the integrity of shoreline structures. Salt and flood tolerant plant species shall be planted below the five foot contour to ensure greater survival of the plantings. Said restoration shall be installed prior to the issuance of the certificate of occupancy or release of the building permit.

12. Backfill material shall be well drained sandy material consistent with the properties and characteristics of the Psammets soil series.
13. All construction activity associated with the shoreline rehardening (riprap revetment and vinyl bulkhead) shall occur prior to or concurrent with the construction of the upland improvements. Said activities shall be coordinated with a pre-construction

meeting held with the Waterfront Operation Inspector and CBPA Inspector prior to any land disturbance, including demolition.

14. The overall impervious cover of the site shall be a maximum of 5,025 square feet or 30.5 percent of the site.
15. ****As offered by the applicant, payment shall be made to the Lynnhaven Oyster Heritage Program concurrent with site plan approval. Payment shall be in the amount of \$430.83 and is based on 25 percent of the proposed impervious cover within the Resource Protection Area (RPA). Said payment shall provide for the equivalent of an approximate 470 square feet, 12 inch deep oyster shell plant within the Lynnhaven River Basin.**
16. It is the opinion of the Board that the approval granted is the maximum impervious cover the site can support.
17. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the exhibit plan dated January 27, 2017, prepared by Gallup Surveyors and Engineers, signed January 27, 2017 by Jessica Nelson. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the Board exhibit prepared by the applicant and presented to the Board, the application submitted and the sworn presentation to the Board.

Billy Garrington of Governmental Permitting Consultants appeared before the Board representing the applicants.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. Sobota, seconded by Mr. Poole to approve the variance with the 17 conditions listed above. All voted for the motion except Mr. Jones and Mrs. McDaniels who voted no.

AYE	7	NO	2	ABSTAIN	0	ABSENT	0
FRANCE		AYE					
JESTER		AYE					
JONES		NO					
MARTIN		AYE					
MCCOY		AYE					
MCDANIELS		NO					
POOLE		AYE					
SMITH		AYE					
SOBOTA		AYE					



Applicant **John Soles**
Address **3936 Shore Drive**
Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
City Council District **Bayside**

Agenda
Item

2

Description: GPIN: 1489-18-4728

AGENT: Beth Caffrey

BOARD ACTION: APPROVED WITH 9 CONDITIONS ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

CPBA Variance Conditions:

1. A pre-construction meeting shall be held with the CBPA Inspector prior to any land disturbance, including demolition.
2. Land disturbance shall be limited to the area necessary to provide for the proposed use or development. Said areas of land disturbance shall be quantified on revised site plan submittals.
3. Construction limits shall be delineated in the field with Civil Inspections. **Within the RPA, exclusive of limits of construction, areas of existing landscaped beds, trees, areas of existing leaf litter or forest floor, and other naturalized areas, such as shoreline vegetation, may not be removed.**
4. For all trees to be preserved outboard of the limits of construction that are encroached upon, replacement of existing vegetation shall be provided at a 3 to 1 ratio for all unauthorized (damaged or removed) vegetation impacts.
5. Permanent and / or temporary soil stabilization measures shall be applied to all disturbed / denuded area(s) prior to a final building inspection or certificate of occupancy. All disturbed or denuded areas shall be stabilized in accordance with the Virginia Erosion and Sediment Control Law and Regulations.
6. Buffer restoration shall be installed equal to 200 percent of the proposed new impervious cover within the RPA: **300 square feet x 200 percent = 600 square feet.**

Said restoration shall achieve the full complement of vegetation consisting of canopy trees, understory trees, shrubs and groundcovers consistent with the Riparian Buffers Modification & Mitigation Guidance Manual, prepared by Virginia Dept. of Conservation

& Recreation, Chesapeake Bay Local Assistance: **2 canopy trees, 2 understory, 4 large shrubs, and 6 small shrubs.**

The required restoration shall be located in the Resource Protection Area, in areas currently devoted to turf or where impervious cover is removed. The restoration shall be installed beginning in the seaward portion of the buffer and progressing landward and shall have a mulch layer of organic material 4 inches to 6 inches in depth. Said mulched restoration areas shall be maintained and not removed or allowed to revert to turf in the future. The required trees shall be comprised of approximately 50 percent deciduous and 50 percent evergreen species and shall be evenly distributed within the RPA buffer. Trees shall not be planted within 15 feet of the shoreline where such planting would result in marsh shading or interference with the integrity of shoreline structures. Salt and flood tolerant plant species shall be planted below the five foot contour to ensure greater survival of the plantings. Said restoration shall be installed prior to the issuance of the certificate of occupancy or release of the building permit.

7. No perimeter fill is authorized outboard of the proposed improvements.
8. Gravel downspout intercepts and/or gravel dripline intercepts shall be provided as a means of erosion and sediment control for stormwater run-off from the proposed improvements.
9. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the exhibit prepared by the applicant and presented to the Board. Said exhibit and conditions shall be submitted to the Department of Planning, Zoning Division for review and approval prior to the issuance of a building permit. The Zoning Division and/or Permits and Inspections may require additional information that may affect the release of a building permit.

John Soles, homeowner appeared before the Board.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. Smith, seconded by Mr. Martin to approve the variance with the 9 conditions listed above. All voted for the motion except Mr. France and Mr. McCoy who voted no.

AYE 7 NO 2 ABSTAIN 0 ABSENT 0

FRANCE NO
JESTER AYE
JONES AYE
MARTIN AYE
MCCOY NO
MCDANIELS AYE
POOLE AYE
SMITH AYE
SOBOTA AYE



Applicant **David and Haritini Williams**
Address **758 Sheraton Drive**
Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
City Council District **Lynnhaven**

Agenda
Item

3

Description: GPIN: 1488-22-1048

AGENT: David Williams

BOARD ACTION: APPROVED WITH 10 CONDITIONS ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

CPBA Variance Conditions:

1. A pre-construction meeting shall be held with the CBPA Inspector prior to any land disturbance, including demolition.
2. Land disturbance shall be limited to the area necessary to provide for the proposed use or development. Said areas of land disturbance shall be quantified on revised site plan submittals.
3. Construction limits shall be delineated in the field with Civil Inspections. **Within the RPA, exclusive of limits of construction, areas of existing landscaped beds, trees, areas of existing leaf litter or forest floor, and other naturalized areas, such as shoreline vegetation, may not be removed.**
4. For all trees to be preserved outboard of the limits of construction that are encroached upon, replacement of existing vegetation shall be provided at a 3 to 1 ratio for all unauthorized (damaged or removed) vegetation impacts.
5. Permanent and / or temporary soil stabilization measures shall be applied to all disturbed / denuded area(s) prior to a final building inspection or certificate of occupancy. All disturbed or denuded areas shall be stabilized in accordance with the Virginia Erosion and Sediment Control Law and Regulations.
6. Buffer restoration shall be installed equal to 200 percent of the proposed new impervious cover within the RPA: **360 square feet x 200 percent = 720 square feet.**

Said restoration shall achieve the full complement of vegetation consisting of canopy trees, understory trees, shrubs and groundcovers consistent with the Riparian Buffers Modification & Mitigation Guidance Manual, prepared by Virginia Dept. of Conservation

& Recreation, Chesapeake Bay Local Assistance: **2 canopy trees, 2 understory, 4 large shrubs, and 6 small shrubs.**

The required restoration shall be located in the Resource Protection Area, in areas currently devoted to turf or where impervious cover is removed. The restoration shall be installed beginning in the seaward portion of the buffer and progressing landward and shall have a mulch layer of organic material 4 inches to 6 inches in depth. Said mulched restoration areas shall be maintained and not removed or allowed to revert to turf in the future. The required trees shall be comprised of approximately 50 percent deciduous and 50 percent evergreen species and shall be evenly distributed within the RPA buffer. Trees shall not be planted within 15 feet of the shoreline where such planting would result in marsh shading or interference with the integrity of shoreline structures. Salt and flood tolerant plant species shall be planted below the five foot contour to ensure greater survival of the plantings. Said restoration shall be installed prior to the issuance of the certificate of occupancy or release of the building permit.

7. No perimeter fill is authorized outboard or seaward of the proposed improvements.
8. Mature trees exist adjacent to tidal waters, the select removal of lower tree limbs shall be performed thereby permitting sunlight to interface with tidal fringe marsh.
9. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the exhibit prepared by the applicant and presented to the Board. Said exhibit and conditions shall be submitted to the Department of Planning, Zoning Division for review and approval prior to the issuance of a building permit. The Zoning Division and/or Permits and Inspections may require additional information that may affect the release of a building permit.
10. The proposed stone paver area with fire pit shall be reduced to a 6 feet x 6 feet area in the location as shown on the plans, and the 250 square foot planting area shall remain as shown on the plans.

Haritini Williams, owner and Amy McKay appeared before the Board.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. Jones, seconded by Mr. McCoy to approve the variance with 10 conditions as amended (Added Condition 10). A substitute motion was made by Mr. Martin, seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the variance with 10 conditions as amended (Added a revised Condition 10). All voted for the substitute motion except Mr. Jones, Mr. McCoy, Mrs. McDaniels, and Mr. Sobota who voted no.

AYE 5 NO 4 ABSTAIN 0 ABSENT 0

FRANCE AYE
JESTER AYE
JONES NO
MARTIN AYE
MCCOY NO
MCDANIELS NO
POOLE AYE
SMITH AYE
SOBOTA NO



Applicant **Charles and Elizabeth Walker**
Address **1253 N Bay Shore Drive**
Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
City Council District **Lynnhaven**

Agenda
Item

4

Description: GPIN: 2418-19-6272

AGENT: Eddie Bourdon, Sykes Bourdon Ahern & Levy

BOARD ACTION: DEFERRED FOR 90 DAYS ON FEBRAURY 27, 2017 UNTIL THE MAY 22, 2017 PUBLIC HEARING

Billy Garrington of Governmental Permitting Consultants appeared before the Board to request a 90 day deferral as per Eddie Bourdon, the applicant's representative.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. McCoy, seconded by Mr. Martin to defer the variance request for 90 days until the May 22, 2017 public hearing. All voted for the motion.

AYE 9 NO 0 ABSTAIN 0 ABSENT 0

**FRANCE AYE
JESTER AYE
JONES AYE
MARTIN AYE
MCCOY AYE
MCDANIELS AYE
POOLE AYE
SMITH AYE
SOBOTA AYE**



Applicant **Richard Dickens**
Address **3545 N Crestline Drive**
Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
City Council District **Kempsville**

Agenda
Item

5

Description: GPIN: 1457-20-5010

AGENT: Billy Garrington, Governmental Permitting Consultants

BOARD ACTION: APPROVED WITH 21 CONDITIONS ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

CPBA Variance Conditions:

1. A pre-construction meeting shall be held with the CBPA Inspector prior to any land disturbance, including demolition.
2. Land disturbance shall be limited to the area necessary to provide for the proposed use or development. Said areas of land disturbance shall be quantified on revised site plan submittals.
3. The construction access way, staging area, stockpiling area and contractor parking area shall be noted on the site plan. **Said areas shall be quantified as land disturbance if not occurring on a paved or graveled surface.**
4. Wire reinforced 36 inch silt fence, for erosion and sedimentation control measures, shall be installed prior to any land disturbance and shall remain in place until such time as vegetative cover is established. Said silt fence shall be installed as delineated per the CBPA Variance Exhibit.
5. Construction limits shall lie within the limits of the silt fence delineated per the CBPA Variance Exhibit.
6. Permanent and / or temporary soil stabilization measures shall be applied to all disturbed / denuded area(s) prior to a final building inspection or certificate of occupancy. All disturbed or denuded areas shall be stabilized in accordance with the Virginia Erosion and Sediment Control Law and Regulations.
7. A site plan shall be submitted to the Department of Planning and Community Development, Development Services Center (DSC) for review and approval prior to the issuance of a building permit.

8. Submitted concurrent with the site plan shall be a separate planting / buffer restoration plan detailing location, number, and species of vegetation to be installed as per the buffer restoration requirements. The planting / buffer restoration plan shall clearly delineate existing naturalized area (forest floor), planting beds, turf zones and areas of shoreline vegetation to be managed permitting sunlight to interface with tidal fringe marsh.
9. Stormwater management shall comply with the requirements set forth within the Code of Ordinances, Appendix D – Stormwater Management.
10. Buffer restoration shall be installed equal to 200 percent of the proposed new impervious cover within the RPA: **2,070 square feet x 200 percent = 4,140 square feet.**

Said restoration shall achieve the full complement of vegetation consisting of canopy trees, understory trees, shrubs and groundcovers consistent with the Riparian Buffers Modification & Mitigation Guidance Manual, prepared by Virginia Dept. of Conservation & Recreation, Chesapeake Bay Local Assistance: **11 canopy trees, 11 understory, 22 large shrubs and 33 shrubs.**

The required restoration shall be located in the Resource Protection Area, in areas currently devoted to turf or where impervious cover is removed. The restoration shall be installed beginning in the seaward portion of the buffer and progressing landward and shall have a mulch layer of organic material 4 inches to 6 inches in depth. Said mulched restoration areas shall be maintained and not removed or allowed to revert to turf in the future. The required trees shall be comprised of approximately 50 percent deciduous and 50 percent evergreen species and shall be evenly distributed within the RPA buffer. Trees shall not be planted within 15 feet of the shoreline where such planting would result in marsh shading or interference with the integrity of shoreline structures. Salt and flood tolerant plant species shall be planted below the five foot contour to ensure greater survival of the plantings. Said restoration shall be installed prior to the issuance of the certificate of occupancy or release of the building permit.

11. All construction activity associated with the shoreline rehardening (riprap revetment with marsh sill) shall occur prior to or concurrent with the construction of the upland improvements. Said activities shall be coordinated with a pre-construction meeting held with the Waterfront Operation Inspector and CBPA Inspector prior to any land disturbance, including demolition.
12. The amount of proposed concrete within the 100 foot Resource Protection Area (RPA) buffer shall be reduced by 250 square feet, and shall be depicted as such on the final site plan.

13. The section of concrete driveway beginning at the attached garage and terminating at the detached garage shall utilize driveway runners. Said driveway runners shall be approximately 2 feet in width with a minimum of 3 feet of permeable material (sod, mulch, uncompact river stone, etc.) between said driveway runners. Said runners shall be depicted as such on the final site plan.
14. The proposed shed shall be eliminated. The elimination of the proposed shed does not count towards the 250 square feet reduction of proposed concrete within the 100 foot Resource Protection Area (RPA) as required by condition 12.
15. No perimeter fill is authorized outboard or seaward of the proposed improvements.
16. Gravel downspout intercepts and/or gravel dripline intercepts shall be provided as a means of erosion and sediment control for stormwater run-off from the proposed improvements.
17. ****As offered by the applicant, payment shall be made to the Lynnhaven Oyster Heritage Program concurrent with site plan approval. Payment shall be in the amount of \$473.91 and is based on 25 percent of the proposed impervious cover within the Resource Protection Area (RPA). Said payment shall provide for the equivalent of an approximate 517 square feet, 12 inch deep oyster shell plant within the Lynnhaven River Basin.**
18. It is the opinion of the Board that the approval granted is the maximum impervious cover the site can support.
19. This variance and associated conditions **will supersede** the conditions of the Board variance granted September 23, 2013.
20. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the exhibit plan dated February 3, 2017, prepared by John E. Brunelle L.S., signed February 7, 2017 by John E. Brunelle. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the Board exhibit prepared by the applicant and presented to the Board, the application submitted and the sworn presentation to the Board. Deviation from said conditions during site plan review may require re-submittal for Board consideration.
21. In addition to the buffer restoration required by condition 10; the mitigation from November 2, 2016, Notice to Comply letter shall be installed, resulting in 9 trees to mitigate for the unauthorized removal of 3 canopy trees.

Billy Garrington of Governmental Permitting Consultants appeared before the Board representing the applicant.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. Martin, seconded by Mr. Poole to approve the variance with the 21 conditions as amended (Amended Condition 14 and added Condition 21). All voted for the motion.

AYE	9	NO	0	ABSTAIN	0	ABSENT	0
-----	---	----	---	---------	---	--------	---

FRANCE	AYE
JESTER	AYE
JONES	AYE
MARTIN	AYE
MCCOY	AYE
MCDANIELS	AYE
POOLE	AYE
SMITH	AYE
SOBOTA	AYE



Applicant **Kenneth and Judith Thrasher**
Address **2101 Pallets Court**
Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
City Council District **Beach**

Agenda
Item

6

Description: GPIN: 2407-27-0164

AGENT: Kenneth Thrasher

BOARD ACTION: APPROVED WITH 6 CONDITIONS ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

CPBA Variance Conditions:

1. Buffer restoration shall be installed equal to 200 percent of the proposed new impervious cover within the RPA: **120 square feet x 200 percent = 240 square feet.**

Said restoration shall achieve the full complement of vegetation consisting of canopy trees, understory trees, shrubs and groundcovers consistent with the Riparian Buffers Modification & Mitigation Guidance Manual, prepared by Virginia Dept. of Conservation & Recreation, Chesapeake Bay Local Assistance: **1 canopy trees, 2 understory, and 3 shrubs.**

The required restoration shall be located in the Resource Protection Area, in areas currently devoted to turf or where impervious cover is removed. The restoration shall be installed beginning in the seaward portion of the buffer and progressing landward and shall have a mulch layer of organic material 4 inches to 6 inches in depth. Said mulched restoration areas shall be maintained and not removed or allowed to revert to turf in the future. The required trees shall be comprised of approximately 50 percent deciduous and 50 percent evergreen species and shall be evenly distributed within the RPA buffer. Trees shall not be planted within 15 feet of the shoreline where such planting would result in marsh shading or interference with the integrity of shoreline structures. Salt and flood tolerant plant species shall be planted below the five foot contour to ensure greater survival of the plantings. Said restoration shall be installed prior to the issuance of the certificate of occupancy or release of the building permit.

2. The existing downspouts shall be disconnected from the corrugated pipe discharging at the toe of slope. Said down spouts shall allow stormwater run-off from existing downspouts to sheetflow across existing uplands.

3. Gravel downspout intercepts shall be provided as a means of erosion and sediment control for stormwater run-off from existing downspouts.
4. No perimeter fill is authorized outboard or seaward of the proposed improvements.
5. A **CBPA / CIVIL permit** must be obtained within 30 days. All required buffer restoration must be installed or in the process of installation within 45 days after issuance of the building permit. Failure to comply with this condition may result in a show cause hearing.
6. The conditions and approval associated with this variance are based on the exhibit prepared by the applicant and presented to the Board. Said exhibit and conditions shall be submitted to the Department of Planning, Zoning Division for review and approval prior to the issuance of a building permit. The Zoning Division and/or Permits and Inspections may require additional information that may affect the release of a building permit.

Kenneth Thrasher, homeowner appeared before the Board.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. McCoy, seconded by Mr. Sobota to approve the variance with the 6 conditions listed above. All voted for the motion.

AYE 9 NO 0 ABSTAIN 0 ABSENT 0

**FRANCE AYE
 JESTER AYE
 JONES AYE
 MARTIN AYE
 MCCOY AYE
 MCDANIELS AYE
 POOLE AYE
 SMITH AYE
 SOBOTA AYE**



Applicant **Kenneth and Judith Thrasher – Restoration Hearing**
 Address **2101 Pallets Court**
 Public Hearing **February 27, 2017**
 City Council District **Beach**

Agenda Item
7

Description: GPIN: 2407-27-0164

AGENT: Kenneth Thrasher

BOARD ACTION: REMOVED ON FEBRUARY 27, 2017

Kenneth Thrasher, homeowner appeared before the Board.

There was no opposition present.

A motion was made by Mr. McCoy, seconded by Mr. Sobota to remove this restoration application based on the approval of their after the fact permit (Case 6). All voted for the motion.

AYE 9 NO 0 ABSTAIN 0 ABSENT 0

FRANCE AYE
JESTER AYE
JONES AYE
MARTIN AYE
MCCOY AYE
MCDANIELS AYE
POOLE AYE
SMITH AYE
SOBOTA AYE