Office of the City Auditor

Audit of Selected Revenue Collection Points

Report Date: October 31, 2013
Office of the City Auditor

“Promoting Accountability and Integrity in City Operations”

Lyndon Remias, CPA, CIA
City Auditor

Timothy Bell, CICA
Senior Auditor

www.vbgov.com/cityauditor
I am pleased to present the report of our audit of the City’s Selected Revenue Collection Points. Our audit focused on the policies and procedures use at the various revenue collection locations.

Overall, based on our audit, the processes and controls governing revenue collection including the receiving, recording, depositing and reconciliation of revenues to City accounting records were adequate, but management can enhance these processes and improve efficiency by implementing our recommendations related to controlling and monitoring of the City’s revenue collection.

Findings considered to be of insignificant risk have been discussed with management. The results of this audit will be provided to City Council through the City’s Audit Committee.

The Office of the City Auditor reports to City Council through the City’s Audit Committee and is organizationally independent of all other City Departments. This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Audit Committee, City Council, City Manager, and appropriate management. It is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties. However, this report is a matter of public record and its distribution is not limited.

We would like to thank the staff of the Finance Department and the various City departments we visited for their courteous and prompt assistance during our audit.

If you have any questions about this report, or any audit-related issue, I can be reached at 385.5872 or via email at lremias@vbgov.com.

Respectfully submitted,

Lyndon S. Remias, CPA, CIA
City Auditor

c: City Council Members
Audit Committee Members
Dave Hansen, Deputy City Manager
Patricia Phillips, Director of Finance

The Office of the City Auditor is an independent audit function reporting directly to the Virginia Beach City Council.
The Office of the City Auditor is an independent audit function reporting directly to the Virginia Beach City Council.

Transmittal Letter ............................................................................................................................... i
Purpose ............................................................................................................................................. 1
Scope & Objective ............................................................................................................................. 1
Methodology ....................................................................................................................................... 1
Standards ........................................................................................................................................... 1
Background ......................................................................................................................................... 2
Findings and Recommendations ......................................................................................................... 5
Conclusion .......................................................................................................................................... 9
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................................ 9
Appendix 1 .......................................................................................................................................... 10
Appendix 2 .......................................................................................................................................... 12
Management’s Response ................................................................................................................... Attachment A
Purpose

The purpose of our audit was to review of the process and adequacy of internal controls over the collection, depositing and reconciling of revenue at various programs and locations throughout the City.

Scope & Objective

The audit covered the policies and procedures in place at all City locations where cash and checks are received as revenue. These locations do not include the locations with a Point-of-Sale (POS) system/register such as Libraries, Recreation Centers, Farmer’s Market, Virginia Aquarium Museum stores, Treasurer’s Office and Commissioner of Revenue. We conducted our fieldwork from April 4, 2013 through September 25, 2013.

Methodology

To accomplish our objectives, we performed the following procedures:

• Determined the location of the City’s revenue collection points.
• Reviewed policies and procedures at each location regarding collecting, depositing and recording of fees and other monies and met with appropriate staff to discuss such.
• Examined procedures related to the safeguarding of cash received.
• Reviewed internal controls through inquiry and examination of documents and identified high-risk areas.
• Compared revenue reported via the deposit transmittals to actual Treasurer’s records.
• Made recommendations to improve processes, increase efficiency and strengthen the internal controls associated with revenue collection at the City’s various revenue collection points.

Standards

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained during this audit provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The Office of the City Auditor reports to City Council through the Audit Committee and is organizationally independent of all City Departments. This report will be distributed to the City’s Audit Committee, City Council, City Manager, and appropriate management within the City of Virginia Beach. This report will also be made available to the public.
Background

The City of Virginia Beach Treasurer’s Office is the custodian of all public monies of the City, and their primary purpose is the collection of revenues on behalf of the City. However, there are various locations throughout the City who handle revenue in cash, checks and credit cards. A location that receives and handles revenue must have both an awareness of and show a commitment to strong internal controls for receiving revenue, especially cash receipts. Management has the responsibility for establishing and maintaining the proper environment of internal controls over the cash handling. This environment is established with written procedures and maintained by awareness through regular communications between management and staff. Management must demonstrate a commitment by example and review. Internal controls are necessary to prevent mishandling of funds and to safeguard against loss. Strong internal controls also protect employees from inappropriate charges of mishandling funds by defining responsibilities in the revenue collection process.

The revenue collection points that are located throughout the City vary in size and collection procedures. Some locations have Point-of-Sale systems (registers), such as the Recreation Centers, Libraries and Museum stores. However, many locations have manual procedures to collect, record, deposit and reconcile revenues and have not been evaluated as to the sufficiency of these procedures to ensure proper and complete accounting of all revenues received. For our review, we limited our scope of coverage to those locations that did not have a Point-of-Sale (POS) system; thereby we did not review the following locations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Locations Not Reviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Libraries (Previously covered under separate audit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation Centers (Previously covered under separate audit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmer’s Market (Previously covered under separate audit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia Aquarium Museum stores (Separate audit underway)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treasurer’s Office (Utilizes a POS system)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner of Revenue (Utilizes a POS system)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, we visited 56 different revenue collection locations throughout the City from April 4, 2013 to September 25, 2013. These locations handled approximately $28,000,000 ($≈$20,000,000 from Social Services) in revenue. The listing of all the selected and visited revenue collection locations is available in Appendix 1.
All locations collecting revenue, especially cash, must develop and implement procedures that address the following elements:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements of Revenue Handling Procedures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Accounting for revenue as it is received;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Separating individual cash handling duties;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safeguarding the handling and storage of cash and checks;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Depositing the cash and checks promptly;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reconciling revenue activity in a timely manner;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Monitoring of the process by administrators not involved.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our audit focused mainly on five areas of revenue collection; the receiving, recording, safeguarding, depositing and reconciliation.

**Receiving**
The key to effective cash control while separating duties is to minimize the number of people who actually handle cash before it's deposited. However, the person receiving the cash should not be the person who deposits it and should not be involved in or have access to accounting records nor be involved in the reconciliation of cash book balances to bank balances. Only employees authorized by management should have access to cash receipts.

**Recording**
The cash accountability ensures that cash is accounted for, properly documented and secured, and traceable to specific cash handlers. A pre-numbered receipt should be given for all revenues, cash as well as checks, when received and recorded in a receipt or log book. Supervisors should approve all voided and refunded transactions.

**Safeguarding**
The revenues should be kept physically protected, including the cash handlers in their physical environment. To promote accountability over revenue, particularly cash, access of cash should be restricted to as few people as possible. When proper cash accountability exists, you can answer following:

- Who has access to cash?
- Why they are permitted to have access to cash/safe/money bag?
- Is the cash in a secured environment?
- What has occurred from the beginning of the transaction to the end?

**Depositing**
The revenues should be deposited by a separate person from those who receive the revenues. All revenues should be promptly deposited and verified by the supervisor(s). The deposit should be reconciled to the transmittal slip and recorded in proper InSITE account codes.
Reconciling
To provide reasonable assurance that all revenues received and are accounted for, reconciliation procedures should be performed. The periodic reconciliations of receipts, deposits and general ledger accounts provide effective checks and balances.

Policies and Procedures
Management should provide policies and procedures for revenue collection to locations that receive any amount of cash. Training should also be provided to minimize the risk of errors and misappropriations.
Findings and Recommendations

Receiving Revenue
The City’s revenue collection locations receive revenue in a variety of ways: in a payment office; through the mail; in a little hut on a fishing pier; and in outlying administrative offices at various City parks. We did not find any significant issues with separation of duties or any other internal controls related to how the revenue is received.

Recording Revenue
In our review of the recording of revenue collections, we found the following exceptions (with number of locations in parentheses):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exceptions to Recording Internal Controls</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location did not have capability to print receipts</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not give out receipts for check transactions</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only gives a receipt upon request</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Departments with exceptions are listed in Appendix 2

The inconsistent use of receipts makes reconciliation of revenue receipts to deposits difficult and increases the risk of concealed errors or irregularities going unchecked. This increases the risk of lost or stolen cash receipts and could project inaccurate application of revenues to department accounts.

Recommendations
1.1  Implement requirement that all revenue collection locations issue pre-numbered receipts for cash and checks received.

1.2  Require use of receipt logbooks for recording all receipts issued.
Safeguarding Revenue

The following are some issues we found at the revenue collection locations with regards to the safeguarding of revenues received:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exceptions to Safeguarding Internal Controls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• No safe or locking cash box (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• No locking money bag used for deposits (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safe in use does not securely protect revenues (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safe is at location but not in use (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safe is left open during operating hours (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safe was not working at time of our visit (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• File cabinet lock not used (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Safe is not bolted to the ground (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Too many employees have access to the safe (2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Any lack of strong safeguards over possession of cash revenues increases the risk of lost and stolen cash receipts and creates an unsafe work environment. Also, weak safeguarding controls increases risk of improper use of City assets, i.e. “borrowing” and inaccurate application of cash receipts to City accounts due to missing money.

Recommendations

2.1 Require the use of locking money bags for safekeeping and transportation of monies to deposit site.

2.2 Require purchase of safe(s) or locking cash boxes to securely protect contents as appropriate to the location. Bolt safes to the floor if possible.

2.3 Use all available features of locking file cabinets with key or combination locks when location requires the use of lock box.

2.4 Minimize the number of people with access to the safe(s) or locking cash boxes.
Depositing Revenue

The following are some issues we found at the revenue collection locations with regards to the depositing of revenues received:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exceptions to Depositing Internal Controls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Interoffice mail used to transport checks (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Revenues for deposit being sent to Finance/Comptroller’s office instead of Treasurer’s Office (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Revenues are not deposited promptly (once a month) (1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each of the exceptions above can increase the risk of lost and stolen receipts. Revenues should always be under the control of the delegated person and accounted for when transferring from one individual to another. Strong internal controls requires the minimal number of people to handle the revenues and for prompt depositing.

Recommendations

3.1 Require all deposits of revenues to be hand-carried to designated bank(s) or Treasurer’s Office.

3.2 Minimize the amount of funds held overnight, i.e. deposit promptly.
Reconciling Revenue

Reconciliation of revenues received to the general ledger is a very important step for management to ensure accountability and completeness of recording all revenues. Below is a chart of exceptions that were found.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exceptions to Reconciling Internal Controls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• No reconciliation of deposits to revenues reported by billing system, customer database, customer orders, receipt book, tickets sold or other documentation (7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reconciliation between department’s internal system to InSITE no longer performed (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Never have done any reconciliation of any type before (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lack of documentation of reconciliations (7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reconciliations between what was deposited to what receipts or departmental systems say should always be conducted by a person independent of the receiving end of the revenue collection process. When reconciliations are not performed, the risk is higher for errors, discrepancies, or irregularities not being detected and misapplication of revenues to department accounts.

Recommendations

4.1 Require all revenues to be reconciled to receipt records, or to departmental database applications to minimize risk that revenues received would be unaccounted for. When feasible, perform a comparison of historical data on a month-to-month or year-to-date basis to review for anomalies.

4.2 Document all reconciliations for management and auditing review.
Policies and Procedures (City-wide and Departmental)

Some revenue collection locations (outside of Libraries and Recreation Centers) do not have formal written training procedures to teach employees their duties regarding revenue collection but rather conduct on-the-job training. Also, the City itself does not have an Administrative Directive or guidance on cash handling within the City. Written revenue collection procedures help clarify responsibilities, provide clear separation of duties and help minimize errors in the receiving, recording, depositing and reconciling processes. The following are revenue collection locations with lack of policies and procedures for revenue collection:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exceptions to Policies and Procedures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Human Services- Community Corrections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Services- Emergency Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Services- Social Services Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Citywide- Accounts Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Business Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Landscape Management Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Marketing &amp; Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning- Permits and Inspections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning- Zoning Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Works- Facilities Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate Assessor- Land Use Program</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recommendations

5.1 Require all revenue collection locations to have written revenue collection procedures.

5.2 Create an Administrative Directive for basic internal controls for revenue handling.

Conclusion

Overall, based on the results of our audit, the processes and controls governing management and oversight of the City’s revenue collection process were adequate. We noted no fraud, but management can enhance these processes and improve efficiency by implementing our recommendations related to the revenue collection process.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the staff of Finance and the various City departments for their courteous and prompt assistance during our review.
### APPENDIX 1

**Revenue Collection Locations Reviewed**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Revenue Collection Point Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>City Attorney</td>
<td>Collections</td>
<td>Building 1- Second Floor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>City Attorney</td>
<td>Land Use Section</td>
<td>Building 1- City Attorney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>City Attorney</td>
<td>Real Estate</td>
<td>Building 20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>City Attorney</td>
<td>Freedom of Information Act</td>
<td>Building 1- FOIA Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau</td>
<td>Visitor Information Center</td>
<td>2100 Parks Avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau</td>
<td>Convention Center Contractor Commissions</td>
<td>Virginia Beach Convention Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau</td>
<td>Event Related Payments</td>
<td>Virginia Beach Convention Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau</td>
<td>Retail Department</td>
<td>Virginia Beach Convention Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau</td>
<td>Ticket Sales</td>
<td>Virginia Beach Convention Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
<td>222 Central Park Ave, Suite 1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Building 1- 3rd Floor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Risk Management</td>
<td>Building 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>Fire Administration</td>
<td>Building 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>Fire Training Center</td>
<td>927 South Birdneck Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Learning and Development</td>
<td>Building 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Human Resources-Beam Advertising</td>
<td>Building 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Human Rights Commission</td>
<td>Building 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Adult Outpatient Services</td>
<td>3143 Magic Hollow Blvd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Child and Youth Mental Health &amp; SA Services</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Office of Reimbursement</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Adult Outpatient Services</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Community Corrections</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Developmental Services &amp; Administration</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>PALS</td>
<td>416 Investors Place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Emergency Services</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Pendleton Child Service Center</td>
<td>Building 23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>Social Services Division</td>
<td>Pembroke 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Library</td>
<td>Wahab Public Law Library</td>
<td>Building 10B- Courthouse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Revenue Collection Point Name</td>
<td>Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Programs &amp; Operations, Out-of-School Time</td>
<td>City Wide Office- Lynnhaven Pkwy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Permitting Office</td>
<td>City Wide Office- Lynnhaven Pkwy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Landscape Management</td>
<td>4141 Dam Neck Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>Building 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Planning, Design and Development</td>
<td>Building 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Business Systems- Set Off Debt Payments</td>
<td>Building 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Marketing Resource and Development</td>
<td>Building 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Owl’s Creek Tennis Pro Shop</td>
<td>928 South Birdneck Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Princess Anne Athletic Complex</td>
<td>Princess Anne Athletic Complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Team Fees</td>
<td>Princess Anne Athletic Complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Field and Facility Fees</td>
<td>Princess Anne Athletic Complex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Special Events</td>
<td>Mount Trashmore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Lynnhaven Boat Ramp</td>
<td>Lynnhaven Boat Ramp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Munden Point Park</td>
<td>Munden Point Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Little Island Park</td>
<td>Little Island Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Red Wing Park</td>
<td>Red Wing Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation</td>
<td>Woodstock Park</td>
<td>Woodstock Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>Development Services Center</td>
<td>Building 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>Permits and Inspections</td>
<td>Building 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>Police HQ – Cashier</td>
<td>Police HQ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>Uniform and Supply</td>
<td>Building 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Technical Services</td>
<td>Building 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Waste Management</td>
<td>3024 Holland Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Fleet Management</td>
<td>Leroy Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Business Center</td>
<td>Building 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Real Estate Collection</td>
<td>Building 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Stormwater</td>
<td>Building 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Real Estate Assessor</td>
<td>Real Estate Assessment</td>
<td>Building 18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# APPENDIX 2

## Exceptions by Department and Division

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Receiving Revenue</th>
<th>Recording Revenue</th>
<th>Safeguarding Revenue</th>
<th>Depositing Revenue</th>
<th>Reconciling Revenue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>City Attorney- Land Use Section</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Interoffice mail used to transport checks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau-Convention Center</td>
<td>Retail Operations- Receipt is not always printed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Contractor Payments/Event Related Payments/Ticket Sales/Retail Operations- No reconciliation documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Convention and Visitors Bureau-Visitor Information Center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Too many people have access to safe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Finance- Risk Management</td>
<td>Does not give receipts for check transactions</td>
<td></td>
<td>Too many people have access to safe</td>
<td></td>
<td>Revenues sent to Finance instead of Treasurer’s Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Fire- Fire Marshall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Revenues sent to Finance instead of Treasurer’s Office</td>
<td>Does not reconcile revenues to Red MX system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Fire- Fire Training Center</td>
<td>Receipts are only given upon request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Does not reconcile revenues to training orders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Human Services- Developmental Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Does not use safe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Human Services- Social Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Safe is left open during operating hours</td>
<td></td>
<td>No reconciliation documentation. Also, does not reconcile revenues to billing system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Human Services- Pendleton Child Service Center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Safe not working at the time of review visit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Human Services- Community Corrections</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Safe does not securely protect revenues (wooden box in use)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Library- Wahab Law Library</td>
<td>No receipts are given (no capability to print receipts)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reconciliation between InSITEx and CLASS no longer performed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Business Systems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Never done reconciliations of any type before</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Landscape Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Does not have a safe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Parks and Natural Areas- Various</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Little Island Park- No locking cashbox on pier</td>
<td>Munden Point Park- Revenues are not deposited promptly</td>
<td>Lynnhaven Boat Ramp/Woodstock Park- No reconciliation between revenues to tickets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Parks and Recreation- Parks and Natural Areas- Red Wing Park</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Planning- Developmental Services Center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Safe not bolted to floor. Also, no locking money bag for depositing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Police- Support Division</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Public Works- Waste Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>File cabinet lock not used</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total** 0 4 11 4 16

Note: Appendix 2 revised 5/26/2014
DATE: October 31, 2013

TO: Mr. Lyndon Remias, City Auditor

FROM: Ms. Patricia A. Phillips, Director of Finance

SUBJECT: Audit of Selected Revenue Collection Points

Thank you for your review of selected revenue collection points including the processes of receiving recording, safeguarding, depositing and reconciling revenue. I am pleased that the audit found adequate processes and controls in place and that no fraud was found. I note that the audit did not cover major revenue collection points that have point-of-sale (POS) systems/registers in place, such as Libraries, Recreation Centers, Farmer’s Market, Aquarium, Treasurer’s Office and Commissioner of the Revenue.

We concur that departments should implement the report’s recommendations for the various collection points identified in the report. We have addressed the findings within our own department for the Risk Management Division. Further, we will work towards the development of a future Revenue Collection Administrative Directive that further clarifies and expands the guidelines for cash receipt controls currently found on our Internal Controls web page.

We are pleased that you found the transmittal form designed for the Farmer’s Market to be an excellent model that could be used by other departments for revenue processing. Thank you for your recognition of Trish Donahue’s work in developing the form during our exit conference.

We are pleased that the audit had favorable findings; however, we understand the potential for fraud and abuse is present and the risk varies with the ethics of the individual collector. We will continue to support the audit recommendations and appreciate the effort that went into the audit report.